

# 19

## (Bāhira) Paṭipanna Sutta

The Discourse on the Practitioner (and the Outsider) | S 48.18 = SD 47.1(3.1.1)

Theme: Those not yet on the path are outsiders

Translated & annotated by Piya Tan ©2014

### 1 Sutta highlights

**1.1 SUTTA SUMMARY.** The (Bāhira) Paṭipanna Sutta (S 48.18) is a short teaching on the 5 spiritual faculties [§1] and how they bring about awakening through sainthood [§§2-3]. The 5 spiritual faculties, or simply, the 5 faculties, as stated, in the Sutta, are those of faith, of effort (or energy), of mindfulness, of samadhi [mental stillness], and of wisdom [§1].

#### 1.2 “OUTSIDERS”

**1.2.1** The Sutta also states that only those who have attained sainthood, at least as streamwinners, are regarded as “practitioners” (*paṭipanna*). Others are still “outsiders” (*bāhira*), as they still have to enter the path. This teaching clearly stresses the urgency of attaining at least streamwinning in this life itself, so that we are not left out of the spiritual life.

**1.2.2** The Sutta commentary defines “outsider” (*bāhira*) as one who exists outside of the state of the 8 noble individuals (*bāhira*’ti imehi aṭṭhahi puggalehi bahi, bhūto, SA 3:236). The 8 individuals are the various kinds of saints in terms of path and of fruition [3.2.1]. These outsiders are also known as worldlings, as they are still fettered to the world with its ignorance and craving.<sup>1</sup>

**1.2.3** The (Sotāpanna) Nandiya Sutta (S 55.40) explains the term “outsider” (*bāhira*) in relation to streamwinning, thus:

**3** “Bhante, when the 4 limbs of streamwinning<sup>2</sup> are all completely and totally absent from a noble disciple, would that noble disciple, bhante, be one who dwells negligently [heedlessly] or not?”

**4** “Indeed, Nandiya, when the 4 limbs of streamwinning are all completely and totally absent from a noble disciple, he is an outsider, one who stands on the side of the worldlings, I say!<sup>3</sup> (S 55.40,3-4), SD 47.1

### 2 The 5 faculties

**2.1** The Sutta Commentary on the (Bāhira) Paṭipanna Sutta says that the 5 faculties here are exclusively supramundane (*lok’uttara*)<sup>4</sup> (that is, they are directly connected with the path) (SA 3:237). Technically, we would have expected the term “spiritual power” (*bala*) to be used in these contexts. Here again, we see the effective simplicity of the early Buddhist texts, where technical terms are mostly absent.

In due course, apparently, the doctrine of the “spiritual powers” (*bala*) were introduced to refer to the exclusive faculties of the noble saints. The term “spiritual faculty” (*indriya*) then took on a more general sense, applicable also to worldlings. It is likely that it is during the second period of the ministry<sup>5</sup> that the two terms, *indriya* and *bala*, became current. Indeed, in the Abhidhamma and later times, the two terms became technical, with *indriya* applying to worldlings and learners, while *bala* is used only for the arhat.<sup>6</sup>

**2.2** The 5 spiritual faculties are defined in **the (Indriya) Daṭṭhabba Sutta** (S 48.4),<sup>7</sup> as follows:<sup>8</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Further see (Sotāpanna) Nandiya S (S 55.40) + SD 47.1.

<sup>2</sup> *Sotāpatti-y-aṅga*: see “I”: **The nature of identity**, SD 19.1 (7.1).

<sup>3</sup> “... He is...I say!” *Tam ahaṃ bāhira puthujjana, pakkhe ṭhito ’ti vadāmi*. As in (Bāhira) Paṭipanna S (S 48.18), SD 47.19, but where the 5 spiritual faculties (*pañc’indriya*) are referred to.

<sup>4</sup> *Imasmiṃ sutte lokuttarāneva indriyāni kathitāni* (SA 3:237).

<sup>5</sup> On the 2 periods of the Buddha’s ministry, see **Notion of diṭṭhi**, SD 40a.1 (1.3).

<sup>6</sup> See R Gethin, *The Buddhist Path to Awakening*, 2001:126-138.

<sup>7</sup> S 48.4 @ SD 10.4(1.1.3).

<sup>8</sup> For details on the 5 faculties, see SD 10.4.

- (1) **The faculty of faith** (*saddh'indriya*) is seen in the 4 limbs of streamwinning (*catu sotāpatti-y-aṅga*). In the streamwinner himself, these are: 1-3. wise faith in the Buddha, the true Dharma, and the noble sangha, and 4. moral virtue dear to the noble ones;<sup>9</sup> or, the 4 conditions conducive to streamwinning: 1. association with true individuals, 2. hearing the true teaching, 3. wise attention, and 4. practising the Dharma in accordance with the Dharma.<sup>10</sup>
- (2) **The faculty of effort** (*viriy'indriya*) is seen in the 4 right strivings (*catu samma-p, padhāna*) or 4 right efforts (*sammā vāyāma*), namely:
1. the effort to *prevent* the arising of unarisen unwholesome states,
  2. the effort to *abandon* arisen unwholesome states,
  3. the effort to *cultivate* unarisen wholesome states, and
  4. the effort to *maintain* [guard] arisen wholesome states.<sup>11</sup>
- (3) **The faculty of mindfulness** (*sat'indriya*) is seen in the 4 focuses of mindfulness,<sup>12</sup> that is,
1. the contemplation of the body (*kāyānupassanā*);
  2. the contemplation of feelings (*vedanā'nupassanā*);
  3. the contemplation of the mind (*cittānupassanā*); and
  4. the contemplation of phenomena (*dhammānupassanā*).
- (4) **The faculty of samadhi** (*samādh'indriya*) is seen in the 4 dhyanas (*catu jhāna*),<sup>13</sup> that is,
1. the 1<sup>st</sup> dhyana (with initial application, sustained application, zest, and happiness);<sup>14</sup>
  2. the 2<sup>nd</sup> dhyana (with zest, happiness, one-pointedness of mind);
  3. the 3<sup>rd</sup> dhyana (with happiness and one-pointedness of mind); and
  4. the 4<sup>th</sup> dhyana (with equanimity, mindfulness,<sup>15</sup> and one-pointedness of mind).
- (5) **The faculty of wisdom** (*paññ'indriya*) is seen in the 4 noble truths,<sup>16</sup> that is,
1. the noble truth, that is, suffering;
  2. the noble truth, that is, the arising of suffering;
  3. the noble truth, that is, the ending of suffering; and
  4. the noble truth, that is, the way leading to the ending of suffering.

### 3 Sainthood

#### 3.1 Discipleship

**3.1.1** Those of us who are not yet at least streamwinners (*sotāpanna*) are regarded as “outsiders” (*bāhira*), because we are outside the path, not yet bound for awakening, with an uncertain rebirth. Only those on the path—the streamwinners, the once-returners, the non-returners, and the arhats—are true “disciples” (*sāvaka*), or more fully, “noble disciples” (*ariya, sāvaka*),<sup>17</sup> the third of the 3 jewels (*ti, ratana* or *ratana-t, taya*) or the 3 refuges (*ti, saraṇa* or *saraṇa-t, taya*).<sup>18</sup> [§3]

Here, *ariya* means “noble” in the sense that one is no more of the world, that is, not a worldly swayed by its conditions (gain and loss, fame and obscurity, blame and praise, joy and pain),<sup>19</sup> and is sure of awakening, that is, as a true “learner” (*sekha*), or has attained full awakening, that is, arhatness. The arhat

<sup>9</sup> SD 47.1 (2.2).

<sup>10</sup> SD 47.1 (2.1+2.3); also SD 3.3 (4.1.1).

<sup>11</sup> See **(Catu) Padhāna S** (A 4.14/2:16 f = D 33,1.11(10)), SD 10.2.

<sup>12</sup> See SD 13.

<sup>13</sup> See **Dhyana**, SD 8.4.

<sup>14</sup> On the dhyana-factors (*jhān'aṅga*). see SD 8.4 (6).

<sup>15</sup> See SD 8.4 (5.2.1+5.4).

<sup>16</sup> *Catusu ariya, saccesu*, viz, the noble truths that are suffering, its arising, its ending, and the way leading to its ending: see **Dhamma, cakka Pavattana S** (S 56.11), SD 1.1.

<sup>17</sup> See **Alagaddūpama S** (M 22,42-47), SD 3.13 & **Ānāpāna, sati S** (M 118,9-12), SD 7.13. Cf “true individual” (*sappurisa*): **Sappurisa S** (M 113), SD 23.7 & **Bāla Paṇḍita S** (M 129,27-50), SD 2.22. See also SD 47.1 (1.2.1).

<sup>18</sup> On the 3 jewels, see **Dhajagga S** (S 11.3.11-15), SD 15.5.

<sup>19</sup> **Loka, dhamma S 1+2** (A 8.5+6), SD 42.2+3.

is just as awakened as the Buddha, and has nothing more to do in terms of working for his awakening. The Buddha's wisdom, however, is unparalleled.

**3.1.2** Those who are not (yet) on the eightfold path as saints are called “outsiders” (*bāhira*). However, even as outsiders, if we regularly “keep close” (*upāsaṅkamati*) to the teaching and the Dharma teacher, we are working towards reaching the path as male followers (*upāsaka*) and female followers (*upāsikā*). “Keeping close” to the teaching entails our diligence in keeping to the 5 precepts, a basic code of natural morality.<sup>20</sup>

The Buddha has given us numerous teachings on how to live as those “close” to the Dharma, as upasakas and upasikas. On a broad worldly (family) and spiritual (individual) levels, we have the teachings of **the Sigāl’ovāda Sutta** (D 31).<sup>21</sup> On a more individual level, in terms of personal growth, there is the teaching on the 12 steps of discipleship, laid out in **the Kiṭṭāgiri Sutta** (M 70) and **the Caṅkī Sutta** (M 95).<sup>22</sup>

### 3.2 THE 8 INDIVIDUALS

**3.2.1 True practitioners.** The (Bāhira) Paṭipanna Sutta gives a progressive list of “practitioners,” that is, the saints, in terms of the strength of their spiritual faculties [2], beginning with the arhat, in a descending order, down to the streamwinner [§2]. This is, in fact, a well known list of the “8 individuals” (*aṭṭha purisa, puggala*) or “8 noble individuals” (*aṭṭha ariya puggala*).<sup>23</sup> We find the same list, without mention of the faculties, but similarly according to their attainment, in **the Kiṭṭāgiri Sutta** (M 70), thus:

(1) The path of streamwinning,	<i>sotāpatti, magga</i>	
(2) The fruition of streamwinning,	<i>sotāpatti, phala</i>	
(3) The path of once-return,	<i>sākad-āgāmi, magga</i>	
(4) The fruition of once-return,	<i>sākad-āgāmi, phala</i>	
(5) The path of non-return,	<i>anāgāmi, magga</i>	
(6) The fruition of non-return,	<i>anāgāmi, phala</i>	
(7) The path of arhathood [holiness],	<i>arahatta, magga</i>	
(8) The fruition of arhathood [holiness].	<i>arahatta, phala</i>	(M 70,14), SD 11.1

#### 3.2.2 Gotra, bhū

**3.2.2.1 The (Navaka) Āhuneyya Sutta** (A 9.10) and a related discourse, **the (Dasaka) Āhuneyya Sutta** (A 10.16), mention a ninth noble individual, “**the lineage-winner**” (*gotra, bhū*), which refers both to the person and to the state (the lineage-changed or a change of lineage).<sup>24</sup> Buddhist literature defines *gotra, bhū* in two ways: (1) the canonical, and (2) the Abhidhamma. The term, however, is rarely found in the Nikāyas.<sup>25</sup>

**3.2.2.2 The canonical definition** of *gotra, bhū*—that is, in the two Suttas above—is simply (non-technically) that of a virtuous monastic who has not yet reached the path of streamwinning, but just on the verge of it. As a generic term, we probably can include in its usage, the “truth-follower” (*dharmānusārī*) and the “faith-follower” (*saddhā’nusārī*),<sup>26</sup> as found in the 10 suttas of **the Okkanta Saṃyutta** (S 25).<sup>27</sup>

<sup>20</sup> On the 5 precepts, see SD 15.11 (2.2.1). On natural morality, see SD 37.8 (2.1); SD 40.1 (13.2).

<sup>21</sup> D 31/3:180-193 @ SD 4.1.

<sup>22</sup> M 70,23-24/1:480 @ SD 11.1, = M 95,20/2:173 @ SD 21.15.

<sup>23</sup> V 5:117; MA 1:167; ThaA 206; Or, more commonly, *aṭṭha purisa, puggala* (D 2:94, 3:5, 227; M 1:37; S 1:220, 2:69, 4:272, 279, 304, 5:429; A 1:208, 222, 2:34, 56, 3:36, 212, 286, 4:407, 5:183, 330; It 88).

<sup>24</sup> A 9.10/4:373 @ SD 80.18 & 10.16/5:23 @ SD 80.19.

<sup>25</sup> In the Nikāyas, it is found only in these 2 suttas; more commonly in the later works: Pug 2, 13×2; Pm (99×). It is very common in the Abhidhamma: esp Paṭ; also Kvu (6×).

<sup>26</sup> See SD 16.7 (1.0.1).

<sup>27</sup> See eg (**Anicca**) **Cakkhu S** (S 25.1), SD 16.7.

Buddhaghosa's term, "lesser streamwinner" (*culla, sotāpanna*) is probably synonymous with *gotra, bhū*, too.<sup>28</sup>

3.2.2.3 The term *gotra, bhū* is used non-technically in **the Dakkhīṇa Vibhaṅga Sutta** (M 142), in a prophetic and pejorative tone, thus:

"In the future, Ānanda, there will be clan-members [(religious) lineage members] who are 'yellow-necks,'<sup>29</sup> immoral, of bad nature. People will give them gifts for the sake of the sangha.  
(M 142,8/3:255,6-7), SD 1.9

The Commentary says that these "clan-members" (*gotra, bhūno*) are those who are monks only in name.<sup>30</sup> They will go about with only a piece of yellow cloth around their necks or arms, and will support their wives and children by engaging in trade, farming, etc (MA 5:74 f). They are those who ritually don the saffron robe, and when they remove them, leave the saffron taints on their necks.<sup>31</sup>

3.2.2.4 The Abhidhamma definition of *gotra, bhū* is that of "one accomplished with a powerful mind of lightning-like insight, the immediate condition for the path of streamwinning."<sup>32</sup> This Aṅguttara commentary refers to the "mind-moment" (*citta-k, khaṇa*) in the cognitive process (*citta, vīthi*) of the path immediately before the "streamwinning path consciousness" (*sotāpatti, magga, citta*), ie, streamwinning itself. This definition is based on a late Abhidhamma "dhamma theory" or theory of moments (*khaṇa*),<sup>33</sup> it does not reflect the sutta usage here.

— — —

## The Discourse on the Practitioner (and the Outsider)

S 48.18

1 Bhikshus, there are these 5 faculties.<sup>34</sup> What are the five?

THE 5 SPIRITUAL FACULTIES

- |                                     |                      |
|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| (1) The faculty of faith            | <i>saddh'indriya</i> |
| (2) The faculty of effort [energy]. | <i>viriy'indriya</i> |
| (3) The faculty of mindfulness.     | <i>sat'indriya</i>   |

<sup>28</sup> Vism 19.27/605.

<sup>29</sup> *Kāsāva, kaṇṭhā*. See M 142,8 n, SD 1.9. See also It 43, 90 (ItA 177); Dh 307a (Dh:P 113, Dh:P 113 *kāṣāya, kamthā*; Uv 11.9 *kāṣāya, kaṇṭhā*; DhA 3:478) qu at V 3:90,35\* (VA 486,22); AA 1:90,13+24, wr *kāsāva, khaṇḍam*; SnA 162,2, 164,23; Sadda,nīti 78,4, 78,1 *kaṇṭha, samaṇa*.

<sup>30</sup> M 3:256,7 = Sāra,saṅgaha 25,9.

<sup>31</sup> On *kāsāva, kaṇṭha*, see M 3:256,7; It 43, 90 (ItA 177); Dh 307a (Dh:P 113, Dh:P 113 *kāṣāya, kamthā*; Uv 11.9 *kāṣāya, kaṇṭhā*; DhA 3:478) qu at V 3:90,35\* (VA 486,22); AA 1:90,13+24, wr *kāsāva, khaṇḍam*; SnA 162,2, 164,23; Sadda,nīti 78,4, 78,1 *kaṇṭha, samaṇa*. Does this uncanny premonition refer to the laicized gurus and their followers who claim to be "neither ordained nor lay order members" in our own times? See Oskar von Hinüber, *Selected Papers in Pāli Studies*, Oxford, 1994:92 f. See (M 142,8/3:255,6-7) n, SD 1.9.

<sup>32</sup> *Gotrabhū'ti sotāpatti, maggassa anantara, paccayena sikhā, patta, balava, vipassanā, cittena samannāgato* (AA 4:170), or this same insight arises as lineage knowledge (*gotrabhū, nāṇa*) with nirvana as its object (*nibbāṇ'arammaṇa*) (AA 5:5). Def at Pug 12, 13 (where PugA 184 says he is one "descending," *okkamanato*, into streamwinning) & Vism 4.74-75/138, 22.1-14/672-675. See also Pm 1:66-68; Tikap 154 f, 165, 324, etc; VvA 155. On the late Abhidhamma use of *gotra, bhū*, see Abhs 4.21/114 = Abhs:SR 66-68; Abhs:BRS 168, 355; Abhs:WG 136. Cf *upanissaya* (J 1:235). On the 9 types of saints, see SD 3.3 (3).

<sup>33</sup> On the controversial theory of moments, see **Matter and moments**, SD 17.2b esp (3); also SD 26.1 (4).

<sup>34</sup> On the 5 faculties, see (2).

(4) The faculty of samadhi [mental stillness].

*samādh'indriya*

(5) The faculty of wisdom.

*paññ'indriya*

These, bhikshus, are the 5 faculties.

## 2 THE FACULTIES AND SAINTHOOD

Bhikshus,

- |  |                          |
|--|--------------------------|
| (1) when the 5 spiritual faculties are harmonized <sup>35</sup> and complete, one is an <u>arhat</u> . <sup>36</sup> | <i>araha</i>             |
| (2) One who is weaker than that is practising for <u>the fruit of arhathood</u> . <sup>37</sup>                      | <i>arahatta,phala</i>    |
| (3) One who is weaker than that is a <u>non-returner</u> . <sup>38</sup>   | <i>anāgāmī</i>           |
| (4) One who is weaker than that is practising for <u>the fruit of non-return</u> .                                   | <i>anāgāmī,phala</i>     |
| (5) One who is weaker than that is a <u>once-returner</u> .  | <i>sakad-āgāmi</i>       |
| (6) One who is weaker than that is practising for <u>the fruit of once-return</u> .                                  | <i>sākad-āgāmī,phala</i> |
| (7) One who is weaker than that is a <u>streamwinner</u> .   | <i>sotāpanna</i>         |
| (8) One who is weaker than that is practising for <u>the fruit of streamwinner</u> .                                 | <i>sotāpatti,phala</i>   |

But, bhikshus, in whom these 5 spiritual faculties are all in all, all and sundry absent, that one is an outsider, who stands on the side of worldlings, I say!<sup>39</sup>

— evaṃ —

141130 141201 141224 151008 161007

<sup>35</sup> Here, *samattā* is better tr as “harmonized” (from *sama*, “even, level”) rather than “fulfilled, complete” (Skt *sam-āpta* or BHSD *samasta*). “Complete” is supplied by *paripūrattā*. See Bdict: indriya-samattā.

<sup>36</sup> *Imesaṃ kho bhikkhave pañcannaṃ indriyānaṃ samattā paripūrattā araham hoti.*

<sup>37</sup> *Tato mudutarehi arahatta,phala,sacchikiriyāya paṭipanno hoti.*

<sup>38</sup> *Tato mudutarehi anāgāmī hoti,*

<sup>39</sup> These 2 lines: *Yassa kho bhikkhave imāni pañc'indriyāni sabbena sabbam sabbathā sabbam n'atthi, tam aham bāhiro puthujjana,pakkhe ṭhito'ti vadāmīti.* Cf a parallel in (**Sotāpanna**) **Nandiya S** (S 55.40,3), SD 47.1, but where the 4 limbs of streamwinning (*sotāpatti-y-aṅga*) are listed.